# **Final Project : Volumetric Surface Reconstruction**

# **by Spencer Van Leeuwen**

```
In [1]: %matplotlib inline
        import matplotlib.pyplot as plt
        from mpl_toolkits.mplot3d import Axes3D
        import mayavi.mlab
        import numpy as np
        import math
        import matplotlib.pyplot as plt
        import maxflow
        from skimage import img_as_ubyte
        from skimage.color import rgb2grey
        from skimage.color import rgb2hsv
```
# **Part 1 : Segmentation**

### **Loading the dataset**

First, we start by loading the dataset. I will be using the temple dataset by **Steven Seitz et al.** [\(http://grail.cs.washington.edu/projects/mview/\). All data is stored in the "temple/" directory. It](http://grail.cs.washington.edu/projects/mview/) contains a set of photos of a sculpture taken from different angles.

A sample image is provided below.



In "temple/temple\_par.txt", we have a parameters file that starts with the number of images in the folder. Every subsequent line has the following format:

file\_name k11 k12 k13 k21 k22 k23 k31 k32 k33 r11 r12 r13 r21 r22 r23 r31 r3 2 r33 t1 t2 t3

where the projection matrix of the given camera is  $P=K\ [R \mid T].$ 

```
In [2]: | img dir = 'temple/'
        file root = 'temple'params = []with open(img_dir + file_root + '_par.txt', 'r') as f:
             for line in f:
                 params.append(line.split())
        num images = params[0][0]params = params[1:]images = []for par in params:
             images.append(plt.imread(img_dir + par[0]))
```
#### **Segmentation of the images**

I have altered the graph cuts code that I submitted for Assignment 3 so that it no longer required user input. Instead, I initialize it by selecting high-intensity pixels as object pixels. In particular, I convert the image to greyscale and take the pixels in the 80th percentile of intensity. K-means with  $k=2$  was giving me trouble. Kmeans could probably be used if we wanted something more general, but I figure that I might as well take advantage of the simplicity of the dataset.

Recall that in Assignment 3, we used k-means to segment the colours then compute the t-links. As an alternative, we were allowed to use colour histogram binning. I started off by using k-means since I already had it implemented from Assignment 3. However, I found that the randomness made it unreliable. In particular, since there is no longer an interactive component, poor groupings by k-means were leading to the algorithm including the table cloth as part of the object. I couldn't find values for sigma and the regulizer that would mitigate this problem. However, I have altered the algorithm to use colour histogram binning and this solved the problem.

Now, we are able to iteratively re-compute the weights of the t-links depending on the likelihood of an object or background pixel being in a given bin. I iterate until < 1% of the pixels change their label from one iteration to the next.

```
In [3]: class MyGraphCuts:
            bgr_value = \thetaobj value = 1none value = 2 def __init__(self, img, sigma=1, regularizer=1, bins_per_channel=
        10, init_percentile=90):
                 self.num rows = img.shape[0]self.num cols = img.shape[1]
                 self.shape = img.shape[:2]self.ing = img.copy() .astype('d')self.sizema = sigma self.regularizer = regularizer
                  self.bins_per_channel = bins_per_channel
                 self.max weight = 2**5-1 self.t_inf = max(4*self.max_weight, regularizer*4*self.max_we
        ight)
                  self.label_mask = self.compute_label_mask()
                 self.seed mask = self.high intensity mask(init percentile)
             # Returns pixels in the 90th percentile of intensity
            def high intensity mask(self, p):
                 grey img = rgb2grey(self.img)bright_pixels = np.percentile(grey_img, p) return (np.sum(self.img, axis=2) > bright_pixels).astype('i')
             # Link weights are regularized to be in the range [0,max_weight].
         This ensures that edge weights
             # are small integers in order to take advantage of optimizations
         in the graph cut library
             def regularize(self, weights, n_link=True):
                min weight = np.amin(weights)
                max\_weight = np.max(weights)weights[:,:] = (self.regularizer if n_link else 1) * \setminus (self.max_weight) * (weights - min_weight)/ab
        s(max_weight - min_weight)
             # n-link weights are computed depending on the difference of pixe
        l intensities
             def compute_grid_weights(self):
                  hor_weights = np.zeros(self.shape, 'd') 
                 hor weights[:,:-1] = np.exp(- (np.linalg.norm(self.img[:,:-1])- self.img[:,1:], axis=2) **2 / self.sigma **2))
                  self.regularize(hor_weights)
                 vert weights = np.zeros(self.shape, 'd')vert\_weights[:, -1, :] = np.exp(- (np.linalg.norm(self.ing[: -1)),:] - self.img[1:,:], axis=2)**2 / self.sigma**2))
                  self.regularize(vert_weights)
```

```
return (hor weights, vert weights)
     # We use a 4-connected grid connecting the pixels
     def add_grid_edges(self, g, nodeids):
        hor_struct = np.array([0, 0, 0], [0, 0, 1],
                                [0, 0, 0]])
        vert_struct = np.array([0, 0, 0], [0, 0, 0],
                                 [0, 1, 0]]) 
        hor weights, vert weights = self.compute grid weights()
         g.add_grid_edges(nodeids, weights=hor_weights, structure=hor_
struct, symmetric=True)
         g.add_grid_edges(nodeids, weights=vert_weights, structure=ver
t_struct, symmetric=True)
     # Compute t-links depending on the likelihood of a pixel's label
 (object or background)
     # belonging to a given colour histogram bin
    def compute tlinks(self, seed mask):
         s_tlinks = np.zeros(self.shape) # background
         t_tlinks = np.zeros(self.shape) # object
        bgr indices = seed mask == self.bgr value
         obj_indices = seed_mask == self.obj_value
         bgr_labels = self.label_mask[seed_mask == self.bgr_value]
         obj_labels = self.label_mask[seed_mask == self.obj_value]
         bgr_size = np.sum((bgr_indices).astype('d'))
         obj_size = np.sum((obj_indices).astype('d'))
         bgr_likelihoods = np.zeros(self.shape, 'd')
         obj_likelihoods = np.zeros(self.shape, 'd')
         for label in range(self.bins_per_channel**3):
            if bgr size > 0:
                bgr cluster size = np.sum((bgr labels == label).astyp
e('d'))
                 bgr_cluster_size = max(bgr_cluster_size, 1)
                bgr likelihoods[self.label mask == label] = bgr clust
er_size / bgr_size
            if obj\_size > 0:
                obj\_cluster\_size = np.sum((obj\_labels == label).astye('d'))
                 obj_cluster_size = max(obj_cluster_size, 1)
                obj likelihoods[self.label mask == label] = obj clust
er_size / obj_size
         s_tlinks = -np.log(obj_likelihoods)
         t_tlinks = -np.log(bgr_likelihoods)
         self.regularize(s_tlinks, False)
```

```
 self.regularize(t_tlinks, False)
         return (s_tlinks, t_tlinks)
     # Greyscale function to evaluate which pixels in img have intensi
ty in
     # the percentile range [lower, upper)
     def get_pixels_in_range(self, img, lower, upper):
         lower_bound = np.percentile(img, lower)
         if abs(upper - 100) < 0.01:
            upper bound = np.max(img) + 1 else:
            upper\_bound = np.percentile (img, upper) return np.logical_and(img >= lower_bound, img < upper_bound)
     # Compute the label_mask based on a colour histogram
     def compute_label_mask(self):
         bins = self.bins_per_channel
        red img = self.img[:,,:,0]green img = self.img[:,:,1]
        blue_img = self.ing[:,:,2] label_mask = np.full(self.shape, bins**3)
        voxel width = 100.0 / bins
         for r in range(bins):
            r_l lower = voxel_width * r
            r_upper = voxel_width * (r+1)
             r_in_range = self.get_pixels_in_range(red_img, r_lower, r
_upper)
             for g in range(bins):
                g_lower = voxel_width * g
                g_upper = voxel_width * (g+1)
                 g_in_range = self.get_pixels_in_range(green_img, g_lo
wer, g_upper)
                 for b in range(bins):
                     b lower = voxel width * b
                     b upper = voxel_width * (b+1)
                      b_in_range = self.get_pixels_in_range(blue_img, b
_lower, b_upper)
                     in_bin = np.logical_and(r_in_range, g_in_range, b
_in_range)
                     index = b + bins * g + (bins * * 2) * rlabel mask[in bin] = index
        self.k = bins**3 return label_mask
```

```
 # This is the "main" function. The framework of the algorithm is
performed here.
     def compute_labels(self):
         seed_mask = self.seed_mask
        epsilon = 0.01delta = 1 while delta > epsilon:
            g = maxflow.GraphInt() nodeids = g.add_grid_nodes(self.shape)
             # Add weighted grid edges (n-links)
             self.add_grid_edges(g, nodeids)
             # Compute weights for colour consistency t-links 
             s_tlinks, t_tlinks = self.compute_tlinks(seed_mask)
             # Add t-links to graph
             g.add_grid_tedges(nodeids, s_tlinks, t_tlinks)
             # Compute min cut segments
             g.maxflow()
             sgm = g.get_grid_segments(nodeids)
             label_mask = np.full(self.shape, self.none_value, dtype=
'uint8')
            label mask[sgm] = self.bgr value
             label_mask[np.logical_not(sgm)] = self.obj_value
             # Compute delta to see if the algorithm should iterate ag
ain
             changed_pixels = (seed_mask != label_mask)
            img\_size = self.shape[0]*self.shape[1] delta = np.sum(changed_pixels) / img_size
             seed_mask = label_mask
         return label_mask
```
#### **Run segmentation algorithm**

Here, we run the segmentation algorithm and save each mask in a separate directory. Greyscale images with the masks overlayed are also saved. This allows us to inspect the accuracy of the segmentation.

```
In [4]: def print_progress(index, length, current):
            progress = (((float)(index) / length) * 10) if ((int)(progress) > current):
                 print (str)((int)(progress)*10) + ('% complete' if index == 0
         else '%')
                  return 1
             return 0
        def save_mask(img, par, mask_dir):
             mask_img_dir = 'temple_mask_images/'
            mask file = mask dir + par[0]mask = np.load(maxk_file + ' .npy')img grey = rgb2grey(img) * 0.7 + 0.3 mask_img = np.zeros(img.shape)
            mask\_img[mask == 1, 0] = img\_grey[mask == 1]mask\_img[mask == 0, 2] = img\_grey[mask == 0]plt.imsave(mask img dir + par[0], mask img)
        def run_segmentation():
            mask dir = 'temple mask/'j = -1a,b = 0, len(images)
             for img, par, i in zip(images[a:b], params[a:b], range(len(images
        [a:b]))):
                  app = MyGraphCuts(img, sigma=0.1, regularizer=300, bins_per_c
        hannel=6)
                filename = mask_dir + par[0] np.save(filename, app.compute_labels())
                  j += print_progress(i, len(images[a:b]), j)
                 save_mask(img, par, mask_dir)
             print 'done'
        # The line below is commented out because the masks are saved, 
        # so we don't need to re-run the segmentation after restarting the ke
        rnel
        # run_segmentation()
```
### **Results**

Here, we present the results of our segmentation. Note that the images were rotated 90 degrees when provided by Steven Seitz *et al.* I have rotated them upright for presentation purposes.











# **Part 2: Visual Hull**

Here is a visual description of what we do in this section from the lecture notes:

# first pass at multiview reconstruction: use silhouettes  $\Rightarrow$  Visual Hull



Assume known cameras  $P_i = K_i [R_i] T_i$ (including position/orientation)

WATERLOO

- Assume that each camera knows object's 2D silhouette  $S_i$ 
	- How can one be obtained?
- Project each camera's silhouette into space to obtain a 3D cone.
- $\blacksquare$  Intersection of the *cones* generated by each image gives the visual hull of the object
	- visual hull is the smallest 3D shape consistent with all silhouettes.

# **Setting up the grid**

Here, we set up a 3D grid. The grid will subdivide the bounding box for the object into voxels. As such, it will have the same world position and dimensions as the bounding box of the object.

```
In [5]: class VoxelGrid:
             def __init__(self, bound_min, bound_max, res): 
                self.bound min = np.array(bound min, dtype='f')
                 self.bound max = np.array(bound max, dtype='f')
                 # res is the resolution along the longest axis of the boundin
        g box
                 # The width of each cubic voxel is calculated accordingly
                self.v width = np.max(np.array((bound max - bound min) / res,
         dtype='f'))
                  self.shape = np.ceil(((bound_max - bound_min) / self.v_width
        )).astype('i')
                self.obj mask = np.full(self.shape, True)
                 self.init center positions()
                 # Pixel dimensions of images from dataset
                  self.img_dim = (480, 640)
             def get_voxels(self):
                  return self.obj_mask
             def get_positions(self):
                  return self.centers
             def init_center_positions(self):
                 # Center of (0,0,0)
                min_pos = self.bound_min + 0.5*self.v_width
                 # Make 3D grid where each cell contains (x, y, z) position
                  pos_grid = np.stack(np.mgrid[ :self.shape[0], :self.shape[1],
          :self.shape[2]].astype('f'), -1)
                 # Add multiples of voxel width to the center of (0,0,0)
                  pos_grid = min_pos + (pos_grid * self.v_width)
                 # Concatenate ones to make homogeneous coordinates
                 pos_grid = np.concatenate((pos_grid, np.ones(np.append(self.s
        hape[:3], 1), dtype='f')), axis=3)
                 # Transpose position vectors to column vectors
                  pos_grid = pos_grid.reshape(np.append(pos_grid.shape, 1))
                  self.centers = pos_grid
             def visual_hull(self, images, params, indices):
                size = len(images)j = -1 for img, par, i in zip(images, params, range(len(images))):
                     self.cull projection(img, par)
                     if (int)(i / (float)(size) * 10) > j:
                         j += print progress(i, size, j)
             def get_proj_mat(self, par):
```

```
K = np. reshape(par[1:10], (3,3)). astype('f')
        R = np. reshape(par[10:19], (3,3)). astype('f')
        T = np. reshape(par[19:22], (3,1)). astype('f')
         return K.dot( np.append(R,T, axis=1) )
    def compute pixel projections(self, par):
         P = self.get_proj_mat(par)
         # Project the center of each voxel onto the image plane
         proj = (P.dot(self.centers)).transpose((1, 2, 3, 0, 4))
         # Normalize the image coordinates and truncate them to get pi
xel indices
        proj = np.concatenate(((proj[:, :, :, 0]/proj[:, :, :, 2]). reshape(
np.append(self.shape,1)),
                                     (proj[:, :, :, 1]/proj[:, :, :, 2]).resh
ape(np.append(self.shape, 1)), \
                                axis=3).astype('i')
        proj[:,[:,:0] = np-clip(proj[:,[:,0], 0, self.img\_dim[1]-1)proj[:,[:,,:] = np-clip(proj[:,[:,1], 0, self.time dim[0]-1) # Images coordinates are (x,y), so we flip x and y
         proj_trans = np.empty(proj.shape, dtype='i')
        proj_{trans}[:, :, : , 0] = proj[:, :, : , 1]proj_{trans}[:, :, :, 1] = proj[:, :, ., 0] return proj_trans
     def cull_projection(self, img, par):
        img mask = self.load mask(par)
         proj = self.compute_pixel_projections(par)
         #valid = np.logical_and(proj[:,:,:,1] >=0, np.logical_and(pro
j[:,:,:,1] < img.shape[0], \
                                  # np.logical_and(proj[:,:,:,0] >= 0, pr
oj[:,:,:,0] < img.shape[1])))
         #self.obj_mask[valid] = np.logical_and(self.obj_mask[valid],
 img_mask[proj[valid][:,1], proj[valid][:,0]] == 0)
         self.obj_mask = np.logical_and(self.obj_mask, img_mask[proj
[:,,:,;0], \text{proj}[:,,:,;1]] == 0) def load_mask(self, par):
         mask_dir = 'temple_mask/'
        img_name = par[0] return np.load(mask_dir + img_name + '.npy')
```
#### **Initializing the grid**

The parameters of the bounding box used below were provided in 'temple/README.txt' alongside the dataset.

```
In [6]: # Set up the voxel grid
        bound_min = np.array([-0.054568, 0.001728, -0.042945])
        bound_max = np.array([0.047855, 0.161892, 0.032236])
        grid\_resolution = 2**9def init_grid():
            return VoxelGrid(bound min, bound max, grid resolution)
        grid = init\_grid()
```
## **Running the visual hull**

After running the graph cuts, some of the images had object pixels marked as background pixels. This could have been solved by:

- playing with image-independent parameters
- a more robust algorithm
- a semi-supervised algorithm
- simply discard undesirable images

I have opted to discard the undesirable images. This is partly due to time constraints and partly because the project specifications explicitly said that we were allowed to use a subset of the images. That being said, you will see in the cell below that the number of remaining images is still reasonable.



## **Rendering the voxel grid**

Here, the object's voxels are rendered using Mayavi.

```
In [8]: def plot_voxels(grid):
              voxels = grid.get_voxels()
             # Transpose and flip axes to get the proper view
            voxels = voxels.transpose((0, 2, 1))[::, ::-1, :]xx, yy, zz = np.where(voxels == 1) mayavi.mlab.points3d(xx,yy,zz,
                                   mode='cube',
                                   color=(0.5,0.5,0.5),
                                   scale_factor=1)
              mayavi.mlab.show()
         # plot_voxels(grid)
```
#### **Results**

Here, we can see the results of our visual hull algorithm. This library uses flat shading for different faces of each voxel. Since all voxels are aligned (rotationally), the camera has been positioned carefully so that we can see the details of the model. If the camera was near perpendicular to any of the voxel faces, the object appeared as a blob (a shape shaded with a single colour). Even some of the provided images are better than others due to this limitation. Ideally, we would use a surface interpolation algorithm (e.g., marching cubes) and lambertian shading (although, that would require substantial effort and is beyond the scope of this project).





# **Part 3: Photoconsistency**

To start, we need to estimate the visibility of any given voxel. For illustration purposes, here is the corresponding course lecture slide:



#### **Signed distance function**

First, we need to start by getting the closest point on the surface to all voxels belonging to the visual hull. To accomplish this, we begin by computing the signed distance function of the grid. This is computed using the fast sweeping method described by Bridson:

Bridson, Robert. Fluid simulation for computer graphics. AK Peters/CRC Pres s, 2015.

In particular, we will set the distance of all surface voxels to 0. We will then sweep along each of the axes and compute the distance of adjacent cells, replacing the current distance to the surface if the new distance is smaller. Since the distances along any given axis may change as we update the grid, we will perform this sweep multiple times (Bridson recommends twice). Note, the voxels inside of the object will be given negative distances so that derivatives point towards the surface.

#### **Implementation note**

In order to make the project readable in a linear fashion, I am going to be defining functions then binding them to the VoxelGrid class. Note that this is the same as defining the function inside the class.

```
In [9]: # Define VoxelGrid class functions
        def init_distances(self):
             # Set distance for all voxels to minus functional infinity
            func inf = np.max(self.bound max - self.bound min) self.dist = np.full(self.shape, -func_inf, dtype='f')
             # Set outside values to the voxel width. This will be needed to g
        et the correct gradient at the surface.
             self.dist[self.obj_mask == False] = self.v_width
             # Set surface voxels to 0
             self.set_boundary_voxels()
        # Look at the outer layer of the bounding box and set a voxel as boun
        dary (distance = 0)
        # if it belongs to the object
        def set boundary along border(self):
            (self.dist[0, :, :])[self.obj_mask[0, :, :]] = 0
             (self.dist[self.shape[0]-1, :, :])[self.obj_mask[self.shape[0]-1,
         :, :]] = 0
            (self.dist[:, 0, :])[self.obj\_mask[:, 0, :]] = 0 (self.dist[:, self.shape[1]-1, :])[self.obj_mask[:, self.shape[1]
        -1, : ] = 0(self.dist[:, :, 0])[self.obj\_mask[:, :, 0]] = 0 (self.dist[:, :, self.shape[2]-1])[self.obj_mask[:, :, self.shape
        [2] -1]] = 0
        # Mark each object voxel as a boundary voxel (distance = 0) if one of
         its adjacent voxels is outer
        def set_boundary_voxels(self):
             # Start with border voxels. They are on the boundary if they belo
        ng to the object
             self.set_boundary_along_border()
             # Check left voxel
            is boundary = np.logical and(self.obj mask[1:, :, :],
                                          self.obj_mask[:-1, : , :] == False(self.dist[1:self.shape[0], :, :]) [is_bound] = 0 # Check right
            is_boundary = np.logical_and(self.obj_max[:-1, :, :],self.obj mask[1; , : , :] == False)(self.dist[:self.shape[0]-1, :, :])[is_boundary] = 0 # Check down
            is_boundary = np.logical_and(self.obj_max[:, 1:, :],
                                          self.obj_mask[:, :-1, :] == False)(self.dist[:, 1:self.shape[1], :])[is boundary] = 0 # Check up
            is_boundary = np.logical_and(self.obj_max[:, :-1, :].self.obj_mask[:, 1:, :] == False)
            (self.dist[:, :self.shape[1]-1, :])[is_bound] = 0
```

```
 # Check in front
    is_boundary = np.logical_and(self.obj_mask[:, :, 1:],
                                 self.obj\_mask[:, :, :-1] == False)(self.dist[:, :, 1:self.shape[2]])[is_bound] = 0 # Check behind
   is_boundary = np.logical_and(self.obj_max[:, :, :-1],self.obj\_mask[:, :, 1:] == False)(self.dist[:, :, :self.shape[2]-1])[is_bound] = 0# After initializing the boundaries, we can calculate distances for t
he object voxels
def fast_plane_sweep(self, num_iterations=2):
    for it in range(num_iterations):
        # Sweep x-axis increasing
        for i in range(self.shape[0])[1:-1]:obj_voxels = self.obj_mask[i, :, :] self.dist[i][obj_voxels] = np.maximum(self.dist[i][obj_vo
xels],
                                                  self.dist[i-1][obj_v
oxels] - self.v_width)
        # Sweep x-axis decreasing
         for i in range(self.shape[0])[::-1][1:-1]:
            obj_voxels = self.obj_mask[i,:,:] self.dist[i][obj_voxels] = np.maximum(self.dist[i][obj_vo
xels],
                                                  self.dist[i+1][obj_v
oxels] - self.v_width)
        # Sweep y-axis increasing
        for j in range(self.shape[1])[1:-1]:
            obj_voxels = self.obj_mask[:,j,:]self.dist[:,j,:][obj_voxels] = np.maximum(self.dist[:,j],:][obj_voxels],
                                                  self.dist[:, j-1, :]
[obj_voxels] - self.v_width)
        # Sweep y-axis decreasing
         for j in range(self.shape[1])[::-1][1:-1]:
            obj voxels = self.obj mask[:,j,:] self.dist[:,j,:][obj_voxels] = np.maximum(self.dist[:,j
,:][obj_voxels],
                                                  self.dist[:, j+1, :]
[obj_voxels] - self.v_width)
        # Sweep z-axis increasing
         for k in range(self.shape[2])[1:-1]:
            obj_voxels = self.obj_max[:, :, k] self.dist[:,:,k][obj_voxels] = np.maximum(self.dist[:,:,k
][obj_voxels],
                                                  self.dist[:, :, k-1]
[obj_voxels] - self.v_width)
```

```
 # Sweep z-axis decreasing
         for k in range(self.shape[2])[::-1][1:-1]:
            obj voxels = self.obj mask[:, :, k]self.dist[:,(:,k][obj~voxels] = np.maximum(self.dist[:,(:,k))][obj_voxels],
                                                   self.dist[:, :, k+1]
[obj voxels] - self.v width)
# Add padding to the distance function. This allows us to get the cor
rect gradient for surface 
# object voxels on the boundary of the grid
def add_dist_padding(self):
    old dist = self.dist.copy() self.dist = np.full( np.array(self.dist.shape) + 2, self.v_width,
 dtype='f')
     self.dist[1:-1,1:-1,1:-1] = old_dist
# Bind VoxelGrid class functions
VoxelGrid.init_distances = init_distances
VoxelGrid.set_boundary_along_border = set_boundary_along_border
VoxelGrid.set_boundary_voxels = set_boundary_voxels
VoxelGrid.fast plane sweep = fast plane sweep
VoxelGrid.add_dist_padding = add_dist_padding
# Call VoxelGrid class functions
# grid.init_distances()
# grid.fast_plane_sweep()
# grid.add_dist_padding()
print 'done'
done
```
## **Gradient of the signed distance function**

Taking the derivative of the signed distance function gives us the direction of the closest point on the surface.

For the derivative, we will be using central differences.

$$
f'(x)=\frac{f(x+h)-f(x-h)}{2h}
$$

Note that the derivatives will be computed for points between voxels (i.e., the center of the voxel faces), so it may resemble to be forward differences when examining the code.

Then, we will compute the gradient at the grid centers. This will essentially average derivatives on either face of a voxel and combine everything into a single structure.

```
In [10]: def compute_derivatives(self):
             self.diff_x = (self.dist[1:, :, :,:] - self.dist[:-1,:,:]) / self.v_width
             self.diff y = (self.dist[:,1:,:] - self.dist[:,:-1,:]) / self.v width
             self.diff_z = (self.dist[:, :, 1:] - self.dist[:, :, :-1]) / self.v_width
              return
         # Compute the gradient and normalize it so that it has unit length
         # Note that the returned gradient has no padding (i.e., it has the sa
         me shape as obj_mask, not dist)
         def compute_gradient(self):
             grad x = (self.diff x[ :-1,1:-1,1:-1] + self.diff x[1: ,1:-1,1:-1]1]) / 2.0
             grad_y = (self.diff_y[1:-1, -1, 1:-1] + self.diff_y[1:-1, 1: -1]1]) / 2.0
             grad_z = (self.diff_z[1:-1,1:-1, -1, -1] + self.diff_z[1:-1,1:-1,1:]) / 2.0
             self.gradient = np.concatenate((grad x.reshape(grad x.shape + (1,)),
                                               grad_y.reshape(grad_y.shape + (1
         ,)),
                                               grad_z.reshape(grad_z.shape + (1
         ,))),
                                             axis=3)
             gradient lengths = np.linalg.norm(self.gradient, axis=3)
             non zero = gradient lengths != 0 gradient_lengths = np.concatenate((gradient_lengths.reshape((grad
         ient_lengths.shape + (1,))),
                                                  gradient_lengths.reshape((grad
         ient_lengths.shape + (1,))),
                                                  gradient_lengths.reshape((grad
         ient_lengths.shape + (1,))),
                                                 axis=3)
             self.gradient[non_zero] = self.gradient[non_zero] / gradient_leng
         ths[non_zero]
         # Bind VoxelGrid class functions
         VoxelGrid.compute derivatives = compute derivatives
         VoxelGrid.compute_gradient = compute_gradient
         # Call VoxelGrid class functions
         # grid.compute_derivatives()
         # grid.compute_gradient()
         print 'done'
```
done

# **Closest surface point**

We now have the distance from each voxel center to the surface and the direction of the surface (i.e., the gradient of the signed distance function). This means that we can easily estimate the closest surface point. Since we have already lost accuracy by discretizing the space, we will round the surface point to the nearest voxel center so that we have access to its gradient.

```
In [11]: # Now that we have computed gradients, we no longer require padding.
          We will remove it so that the shape
         # of self.dist matches the shape of self.gradient
         def remove_dist_padding(self):
              if self.dist.shape[:3] != self.gradient.shape[:3]: # only for deb
         ugging in case function is called twice
                  self.dist = self.dist[1:-1,1:-1,1:-1]
         # Each voxel will contain the index of the closest surface voxel
         def compute closest surface point(self):
              # Compute estimated closest surface point
              distance = np.concatenate((self.dist.reshape(self.dist.shape + (1
         ,)),
                                          self.dist.reshape(self.dist.shape + (1
         ,)),
                                          self.dist.reshape(self.dist.shape + (1
         ,))),
                                         axis=3)
             surface_points = self.centers[:,:,:,:3,0] + self.gradient * dist
         ance
              # Convert to index of the voxel containing the point
             self.surface index = ((surface points - self.bound min ) / self.v
         _width).astype('i')
         # Bind VoxelGrid class functions
         VoxelGrid.remove dist padding = remove dist padding
         VoxelGrid.compute_closest_surface_point = compute_closest_surface_poi
         nt
         # Call VoxelGrid class functions
         # grid.remove_dist_padding()
         # grid.compute_closest_surface_point()
         print 'done'
```
done

#### **Camera positions**

We can compute the position of a given camera center as  $R^{-1}(-T)$ , as seen in Assignment 2.

Note that even though we did not consider all cameras during the visual hull due to non-ideal segmentations in some images, we can still use all cameras for photoconsistency (and we will!).

```
In [12]: def compute_camera_positions():
             cam_pos = [] for par in params:
                  R = np. reshape(par[10:19], (3,3)). astype('f')
                  T = np. reshape(par[19:22], (3,1)). astype('f')
                   cam_pos.append(np.linalg.inv(R).dot(-T))
              return cam_pos
         cam_pos = np.array(compute_camera_positions())
         fig = plt.figure(figsize = (6, 6))ax = plt.subplot(111, projection='3d')
         plt.title('Camera positions')
         ax.scatter(cam_pos[:,0],cam_pos[:,2],cam_pos[:,1], c='b', marker='p')
         plt.show()
```


# **Occlusion of surface points**

While the gradient of the inner voxels points to towards the surface, the gradients of the surface voxels correspond to the normal of the surface. This means that we can compute whether a camera can see a point on the surface using two tests:

- If the dot product of the direction to the camera from the surface  $d_{cs}$  with the surface normal  $\vec{n}$  is greater than 0 (i.e.,  $d^{'}_{cs} \cdot \vec{n} > 0$ ), then the point is (potentially) visible.  $\rightarrow$  $\vec{n}$  $\stackrel{\cdots}{\rightarrow}$  $\vec{n}$
- If the dot product was positive, cast a ray from the surface. If the ray intersects the object, the view is occluded.

Given the setup of the dataset, we are guaranteed that the object is not partially outside of the image. This means that only an occlusion test to determine is necessary (i.e., no clipping/culling is required).

For the ray casting, we will use a fast grid traversal algorithm by Amanatides and Woo:

Amanatides, John, and Andrew Woo. "A fast voxel traversal algorithm for ray tracing." Eurographics. Vol. 87. No. 3. 1987.

```
In [13]: # Computes visibility for all object voxels
         def compute_grid_occlusion(self, camera):
             grid is visible = np.full(self.shape, False, dtype='uint8')
              is_visible, path = self.occlusion_test(camera.flatten())
             grid is visible[self.obj mask] = is visible
              return (grid_is_visible, path)
         # The framework of the occlusion test
         def occlusion_test(self, camera):
              # Test if dot product is less than 0 for visibility
              is_visible = self.angle_check(camera) 
              visible_points = self.surface_points[is_visible]
              visible_pos = self.surface_world[is_visible]
             paths = []hits = []vis\_ind = np.where(is_visible)[0] # If a voxel passes the dot product text, cast a ray
              for index, voxel, pos in zip(vis_ind, visible_points, visible_pos
         ):
                   direction = camera - pos
                   distance = np.linalg.norm(direction)
                   ray = direction / distance
                   hit, path = self.cast_ray(ray, voxel)
                   is_visible[index] = not hit
                   paths.append(path)
                   hits.append(hit)
                   #if hit:
                       #print 'camera: ' + (str)(camera)
                       #print 'pos: ' + (str)(pos)
                       #print 'direction: ' + (str)(ray)
                       #return (is_visible, path)
               return (is_visible, (paths, hits))
         # Take the dot product of all surface points with the ray from the po
         int to the camera. 
         # Visible points have value greater than or equal to zero
         def angle_check(self, camera):
             sw = self.surface world
              sp = self.surface_points
```
 **return** np.sum((camera - sw) \* (self.gradient[sp[:,0], sp[:,1], sp  $[:,2]]$ ),  $axis=1$ ) > 0

```
In [14]: # Check if the ray is occluded by the object using raytracing. This i
         s the algorithm by Amanatides and Woo.
         def cast ray(self, direct, voxel):
             delta x = abs(self.v width / direct[0])delta_y = abs(self.v_width / direct[1])
             delta z = abs(self.v width / direct[2])
             max_x = delta_x / 2.0max_y = delta_y / 2.0max z = delta z / 2.0
             i, j, k = voxel
             step_x, step_y, step_z = (direct / np.abs(direct)).astype('i')
              # This counter allows for a margin of error when computing estima
         ted surface points
             counter = np.zeros((3), dtype='uint8')path = [] while True:
                   path.append(self.centers[i, j, k, :, 0])
                  if max x < max y:
                      if max_x < max_z:
                          i += step_x
                          counter[0] += 1
                          if i < 0 or i >= self.shape[0]:
                               return (False, path)
                          max_x = max_x + delta_x else:
                          k += step_z
                          counter[2] += 1
                          if k < 0 or k \ge 1 self.shape[2]:
                               return (False, path)
                          max_z = max_z + delta_z else:
                      if maxy < max_2:j += step_y
                          counter[1] += 1if j < 0 or j \ge self.shape[1]:
                               return (False, path)
                          max y = max_y + delta_y else:
                          k += step_z
                          counter[2] += 1if k < 0 or k > = self.shape[2]:
```

```
 return (False, path)
                         max_z = max_z + delta_z if self.obj_mask[i,j,k] and np.max(counter) > 1:
                      return (True, path)
              print "ERROR: code should not reach this point"
In [15]: # Declare array containing the index of all surface points and the wo
         rld coordinates of those points
         def init_surface_points(self):
             self.surface points = self.surface index[self.obj mask]
             sp = self.surface pointsself.surface_world = self.centers[sp[: 0], sp[: 1], sp[: 2], : 3,
         0]
In [16]: # Bind VoxelGrid class functions
         VoxelGrid.init_surface_points = init_surface_points
         VoxelGrid.angle_check = angle_check
         VoxelGrid.occlusion_test = occlusion_testVoxelGrid.cast ray = cast ray
         VoxelGrid.compute_grid_occlusion = compute_grid_occlusion
In [17]: # Call VoxelGrid class functions
         # grid.init_surface_points()
         print 'done'
```
done

## **Occlusion results**

Although I don't call the occlusion code until the next section, it seemed that this was an appropriate place to put some intermediate results. They are not really comprehensive. They are just sanity checks because I had some bugs and needed visual output to fix them. Due to this fact, I decided to use a low resolution for these plots so that I could iterate quickly.

We are going to consider one of the datasets where the camera is above the structure. For the two figures below, the camera is red; the points visible by the camera are blue and the raytracing path is green.

In both cases, the path encounters an object voxel and terminates, so the source voxel is not blue (i.e., not visible).



Here, we see the 3D result for the same camera. I attempted to orient the model in the same way as the first of the two images above.



As we can see, the pillars and most of the base are occluded by the top of the temple. This is the expected behaviour.

#### **Photoconsistency calculation**

Next, we need to compute the photoconsistency for each of the voxels. This is illustrated in the following course lecture slide:



CVPR'05 slides from Vogiatzis, Torr, Cippola

```
In [18]: # %matplotlib notebook
         def compute_photoconsistency(self, cameras, params):
             self.ph con = np.full(self.shape, \theta, dtype='f')
              # Store visibility of surface points for all cameras
              print "Computing occlusions"
             vis arr = []j = 0 for i, cam in enumerate(cameras):
                  is_visible, path = self.compute_grid_occlusion(cam)
                 vis arr.append(np.where(is visible))
                  j += print_progress(i, len(cameras), j)
                  # The below code was used for the occlusion results plotting
                  #indices = np.where(is_visible == 1)
                  #points = self.centers[indices[0], indices[1], indices[2], :
         3, 0]
                  #if i == 218:
                  # xx, yy, zz = np.where(is_visible == 1)
                  # mayavi.mlab.points3d(xx,yy,zz,
                  # mode='cube',
                  # color=(0.5,0.5,0.5),
                  # scale_factor=1)
                  # mayavi.mlab.show()
                  # return (cam, points, path)
              # Compute intensity for each (voxel,camera) pair
              print "\nComputing intensities"
              intensities = []
             i = 0 for i, cam, par, vis in zip(range(len(cameras)), cameras, params,
          vis_arr):
                 img = plt.inread(img_dir + par[0])pixel coords = self.compute pixel projections(par)[vis[0], vi
         s[1], vis[2]]
                  intensities.append(img[pixel_coords[:,0], pixel_coords[:,1]])
                  j += print_progress(i, len(cameras), j)
              # Compute the mean intensity for each voxel
             intensity sum = np.zeros(np.append(self.shape, 3), dtype='f')
              for vis, intensity in zip(vis_arr, intensities):
                  intensity_sum[vis[0], vis[1], vis[2]] += intensity
              mean_intensity = intensity_sum / len(cameras)
              self.photo_incon = np.zeros(self.shape, dtype='f')
```

```
 # Compute photoinconsistency sum
              for vis, intensity in zip(vis_arr, intensities):
                 self.photo incon[vis[0], vis[1], vis[2]] += \
                           np.linalg.norm(intensity - mean_intensity[vis[0], vis
         [1], vis[2]], axis=1)**2
In [19]: # Bind VoxelGrid class functions
         VoxelGrid.compute_photoconsistency = compute_photoconsistency
In [20]: # Call VoxelGrid class functions
         # grid.compute_photoconsistency(cam_pos, params)
         print 'done'
In [21]: # Save important data since the raytracer is slow
         save = False
         if save:
              np.save('voxel_data/grid_shape', grid.shape)
              np.save('voxel_data/grid_dist', grid.dist)
              np.save('voxel_data/grid_photo_incon', grid.photo_incon)
              np.save('voxel_data/grid_v_width', grid.v_width)
         done
```

```
In [22]: # Code below was used to generate occlusion plots.
          # cam, points, paths = grid.compute_photoconsistency(cam_pos, params)
          # hits = paths[1]
          # paths = paths[0]
          def plot_occlusion_path():
              ind = 120path = np.array(paths[ind])fig = plt.findure() ax = plt.subplot(111,projection='3d')
               ax.scatter(cam[0], cam[1], cam[2], c='r')
              ax.\text{scatter}(\text{path}[:,0], \text{ path}[:,1], \text{ path}[:,2], \text{ c='g'})ax.\,scatter(points[:, 0], points[:, 1], points[:, 2], c='b') plt.show()
          def plot_visibility_3d():
              xx, yy, zz = np.where(is_visible == 1) mayavi.mlab.points3d(xx,yy,zz,
                              mode='cube',
                              color=(0.5,0.5,0.5),
                             scale factor=1)
               mayavi.mlab.show()
```
# **Graph cut**

Finally, we need to perform the graph cut using the photo-inconsistencies as edge weights. This is illustrated in the following course lecture slide:



# CVPR'05 slides from Vogiatzis, Torr, Cippola

For the source edges, we will simply connect the source to all non-object voxels with (functionally) infinite weight. In order to decide which voxels to connect to the sink, we will use the signed distance function. A voxel will belong to the sink if it is at least 5 times the voxel width away from the surface, each edge having (functionally) infinite weight. For object nodes, incoming edges for any given voxel will have weight corresponding to its photoinconsistency sum. Note that the directed edges are not symmetric according to this description.

I have decided to square the photoconsistency sum before assigning edge weights (as suggested by the project specifications). I found that using un-squared values ensured that the graph would only classify voxels connected to the sink as object voxels (i.e., it was minimizing the allowable surface area). However, this was resolved by using the squared values. I also tried exponential values, but this gave the same results as quadratic for this dataset.

```
In [23]: # Load grid data so we don't need to perform raytracing again
         load = Trueif load == True:
              grid_shape = np.load('voxel_data/grid_shape.npy')
              grid_dist = np.load('voxel_data/grid_dist.npy')
              grid_photo_incon = np.load('voxel_data/grid_photo_incon.npy')
              grid_v_width = np.load('voxel_data/grid_v_width.npy')
         else:
              grid_shape = grid.shape
              grid_dist = grid.dist
              grid_photo_incon = grid.photo_incon
             grid_v_width = grid.v_width
```

```
In [24]: class ReconstructionGraphCuts:
               def __init__(self):
                  self.g = maxflow.GraphInt() self.add_nodes()
                  self.max weight = 2**8-1 self.func_inf = self.max_weight * np.prod(grid_shape) + 1
                  self.photo incon = grid photo incon**2
                   self.lower_bound = min(0, np.min(grid_photo_incon))
                  self.upper bound = np.max(grid photo incon)
                   self.add_node_edges()
                  self.add st edges()
               def add_nodes(self):
                  s = \text{grid shape}self.nodeids = self.g.add grid nodes((s[0], s[1], s[2]))
               # Link weights are regularized to be in the range [0,max_weight].
           This ensures that edge weights
               # are small integers in order to take advantage of optimizations
           in the maxflow library
               def regularize(self, weights):
                   reg_weights = np.empty(weights.shape, dtype='i')
                  reg_weights[:,:,:] = (self.max_weight) * \
                                            (weights - self.lower_bound)/abs(self
          .upper_bound - self.lower_bound)
                   return reg_weights
               def add_right_edges(self):
                  structure = np{\cdot}zeros((3,3,3)), dtype='i')
                  structure[2,1,1] = 1 # Set edge weights to photoinconsistency
                  weights = np \cdot zeros(grid \; shape, dtype='f')weights[:, -1, :, :] = self.ploto_incon[1:, :, :]background voxels = np.logical not(grid photo incon > 0)
                   # Regularize weights to small integers
                   weights = self.regularize(weights)
                   # Set links to non-object voxels as infinite
                  (weights[:-1,:,:])[background_voxels[1:,:,:]] = self.func_inf
                   self.g.add_grid_edges(self.nodeids, weights=weights, structur
          e=structure, symmetric=False)
               def add_left_edges(self):
                  structure = np{\cdot}zeros((3,3,3), dtype='i')structure[0,1,1] = 1
```

```
 # Set edge weights to photoinconsistency
         weights = np.zeros(grid_shape, dtype='f')
        weights[1:,:,:] = self.photo incon[:-1,:,:] background_voxels = np.logical_not(grid_photo_incon > 0)
         # Regularize weights to small integers
         weights = self.regularize(weights)
         # Set links to non-object voxels as infinite
        (weights[1:,:,:])[background_voxels[:-1,:,:]] = self.func_inf
         self.g.add_grid_edges(self.nodeids, weights=weights, structur
e=structure, symmetric=False)
     def add_up_edges(self):
        structure = np{\cdot}zeros((3,3,3)), dtype='i')
        structure[1,2,1] = 1 # Set edge weights to photoinconsistency
        weights = np{\cdot}zeros(grid\ shape, dtype='f')weights[:,:-1,:] = self.ploto_incon[:,1:,:] background_voxels = np.logical_not(grid_photo_incon > 0)
        weights = self.request(\text{weights}) # Set links to non-object voxels as infinite
        (weights[:,:-1,:])[background_voxels[:,1:,:]] = self.func_inf
         self.g.add_grid_edges(self.nodeids, weights=weights, structur
e=structure, symmetric=False)
     def add_down_edges(self):
        structure = np{\cdot}zeros((3,3,3)), dtype='i')
        structure[1,0,1] = 1 # Set edge weights to photoinconsistency
        weights = np \cdot zeros(grid \; shape, dtype='f')weights[:, 1:, :] = self.ploto.incon[:, : -1, :] background_voxels = np.logical_not(grid_photo_incon > 0)
        weights = self.request(\text{weights}) # Set links to non-object voxels as infinite
        (weights[:, 1:, :,:) [background_voxels[:,:-1,:]] = self.func_inf
         self.g.add_grid_edges(self.nodeids, weights=weights, structur
e=structure, symmetric=False)
     def add_infront_edges(self):
        structure = np{\cdot}zeros((3,3,3), dype='i')structure[1,1,2] = 1 # Set edge weights to photoinconsistency
```

```
weights = np{\cdot}zeros(grid\ shape, dtype='f')weights[:,,:,:-1] = self.ploto_incon[:,,:,1:]weights = self.request(\text{weights}) background_voxels = np.logical_not(grid_photo_incon > 0)
         # Set links to non-object voxels as infinite
        (weights[:, :,:-1])[background_voxels[:,:,1:]] = self.func_inf
         self.g.add_grid_edges(self.nodeids, weights=weights, structur
e=structure, symmetric=False)
     def add_behind_edges(self):
        structure = np{\cdot}zeros((3,3,3)), dtype='i')
        structure[1,1,0] = 1 # Set edge weights to photoinconsistency
        weights = np{\cdot}zeros(grid\ shape, dtype='f')weights[:, :, 1:] = self.ploto_incon[:, :, .]weights = self.request(\text{weights}) background_voxels = np.logical_not(grid_photo_incon > 0)
         # Set links to non-object voxels as infinite
        (weights[:, :, 1:])[background voxels[:,:,:-1]] = self.func inf
         self.g.add_grid_edges(self.nodeids, weights=weights, structur
e=structure, symmetric=False)
     def add_node_edges(self):
         self.add_right_edges()
        self.add left edges()
        self.add up edges()
        self.add down edges()
         self.add_behind_edges()
        self.add infront edges()
     def add_st_edges(self):
        source weights = np \cdot zeros(grid \ shape, dtype='f') sink_weights = np.zeros(grid_shape, dtype='f')
        sdf = grid dist # Compute source weights 
        boundary_voxels = (sdf == grid_v_width) source_weights[boundary_voxels] = self.func_inf
         # Compute sink weights
        sink voxels = sdf < grid v width * -5
         sink_weights[sink_voxels] = self.func_inf
         # Add terminal edges
         self.g.add_grid_tedges(self.nodeids, source_weights, sink_wei
ghts)
```

```
 def run(self):
                   self.g.maxflow()
               def get_segments(self):
                   return self.g.get_grid_segments(self.nodeids)
In [25]: print 'start'
         # Run graph cut
         # rgc = ReconstructionGraphCuts()
          # rgc.run()
         print 'done'
         start
         done
```
#### **Results**

Let's see the reconstructed surface using our photoconsistency graph cut.

In [26]: **def** plot\_reconstruction():  $xx$ ,  $yy$ ,  $zz = np.$  where(rgc.get\_segments() == 1) mayavi.mlab.points3d(xx,yy,zz, mode='cube', color=(0.5,0.5,0.5), scale\_factor=1) mayavi.mlab.show() *# plot\_reconstruction()*





I am not sure whether to blame the dataset or the resolution, but it is honestly hard to tell whether this is the "correct" surface reconstruction. In my opinion the roof of the temple looks more crisp (less blob-like) than the surface provided by the visual hull. However, this is subjective, so let's try to systematically demonstrate that the algorithm is working.

Let's start by rendering just the voxels connected to the sink.

```
In [27]: def plot_sink():
              xx, yy, zz = np.where(grid\_dist < grid_v\_width * -5) mayavi.mlab.points3d(xx,yy,zz,
                            mode='cube',
                            color=(0.5,0.5,0.5),
                            scale_factor=1)
               mayavi.mlab.show()
          # plot_sink()
```


As we can see, the sink is simply connected to the deeply embedded voxels. The columns of the temple are substantially narrower than those belonging to the full object (i.e., compared to images presented as results to the visual hull).

Most importantly, we can see that the reconstructed surface is not equivalent to the surface given solely by the voxels connected to the sink.

Now, if we can also show that our final result is not equivalent to that provided by the visual hull, then we know that the graph cut is doing its job and selectively removing voxels from the 3D model. So, let us see what happens if we plot the voxels that belong to the visual hull but do not belong to the surface produced by the graph cut.

```
In [28]: def plot_removed_voxels():
              xx, yy, zz = np.where(np.load_and<u>户and(grid_dist &lt;= 0, np.load_n)</u>
          ot(rgc.get_segments() == 1))) mayavi.mlab.points3d(xx,yy,zz,
                             mode='cube',
                             color=(0.5,0.5,0.5),
                             scale_factor=1)
               mayavi.mlab.show()
          # plot_removed_voxels()
```


As we can see, the algorithm is clearly removing voxels from the visual hull to provide the final surface reconstruction. This confirms that our algorithm is indeed working and it is selectively removing voxels with poor photoconsistency. So, we have succeeded!

## **Lessons from the project**

Here, I just wanted to make some notes about some shortcomings of the methodology used in this project in case I decide to pursue something along these lines in the future.

When performing the segmentation for the visual hull, it is important to have conservative segmentation (assuming that you plan to use a photoconsistency graph cut afterwards). This is because the photoconsistency approach, as it has been described and implemented, cannot restore voxels after they have been culled by the visual hull. So if the segmentation algorithm incorrectly classifies an object pixel as a background pixel, there will be a hole in the final model.

When testing the photoconsistency graph cut, it is good if the visual hull has performed poorly and a lot of the features are missing. This is of course resolution dependent (i.e., the visual hull needs to perform even worse for lower resolutions). The reason for this is because it is difficult to tell if the photoconsistency graph cut has improved the model if the visual hull has already provided a surface that is indistinguishable from correct.

The final lesson is to NEVER implement a raytracer in python!!! Even at the final resolutions that I used in this report, the raytracing took 3 hours. I tried to double the resolution and run it overnight. It completed after 10 hours, but I did not save the data correctly so I was unfortunately stuck with the lower resolution images.

#### **References**

The approach used for each step of this project was my own (following the course slides). I did not reference any research paper or textbook describing how the volumetric surface reconstruction should be implemented. The resources that I used were mainly simple algorithms for 3D grids that I couldn't remember the details of.

Here are my references:

- Dataset by Steven Seitz *et al.* [\(http://grail.cs.washington.edu/projects/mview/\)](http://grail.cs.washington.edu/projects/mview/)
- Bridson, Robert. *Fluid simulation for computer graphics*. AK Peters/CRC Press, 2015.
- Amanatides, John, and Andrew Woo. "A fast voxel traversal algorithm for ray tracing." *Eurographics*. Vol. 87. No. 3. 1987.
- Lecture 9 of the course slides